ORDER SHEET

WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal (Chairman) & The Hon'ble Mr. P. Ramesh Kumar (Administrative Member)

Case No - OA 793 OF 2019

	MADAN MOHAN GHOSH Vs The State of West Bengal & Ors	
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature
Date of order. 1	2	of parties when necessary
	For the Applicant : Mr. S. Majumder,	3
4	Advocate	
27.02.2020		
	For the Respondents: None	
	In this application Madan Mohan Ghosh, the	
	applicant has prayed for certain reliefs, the relevant	
	portion of which is as under:	
	"(a) An order do issue directing the	
	concerned respondent authorities	
	to forthwith release the medical	
	expenditure of Soumya Ghosh	
	dependent of Madan Mohan	
	Ghosh who is a Joint B.D.O.,	
	Goghat, Hooghly."	
	It appears that the applicant's son, Soumya	
	Ghosh met with an accident on 6 th July, 2015. He injured	
	his right eye. But after operation his condition did not	
	improve. On 13 th August, 2015 for better treatment he	
	was taken to L.V. Prasad Eye Institute, Hyderabad. The	
	applicant incurred certain expenditure for treatment and in	
	this application the applicant has sought for post facto	
	permission / approval for reimbursement of the	

ORDER SHEET

Date of order 2 and dated signature	 	
Ghosh. Heard Mr. S. Majumder, learned advocate for the applicant and Mr. G.P. Banerjee, learned advocate for the State respondents. It appears that the applicant had written a letter dated 11th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
Heard Mr. S. Majumder, learned advocate for the applicant and Mr. G.P. Banerjee, learned advocate for the State respondents. It appears that the applicant had written a letter dated 11th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	expenditure made with regard to the treatment of Soumya	
applicant and Mr. G.P. Banerjee, learned advocate for the State respondents. It appears that the applicant had written a letter dated 11th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	Ghosh.	
State respondents. It appears that the applicant had written a letter dated 11th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	Heard Mr. S. Majumder, learned advocate for the	
It appears that the applicant had written a letter dated 11 th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15 th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	applicant and Mr. G.P. Banerjee, learned advocate for the	
dated 11 th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15 th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	State respondents.	
Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	It appears that the applicant had written a letter	
Development Department, with a prayer for post facto approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15 th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	dated 11th February, 2016 to the Deputy Secretary to the	
approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad for his son. On 15 th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	Government of West Bengal, Panchayat and Rural	
for his son. On 15 th April, 2016, the application for post facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	Development Department, with a prayer for post facto	
facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	approval of expenditure regarding treatment at Hyderabad	
rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	for his son. On 15 th April, 2016, the application for post	
approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	facto approval of treatment of Soumya Ghosh was	
no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	rejected on the ground that there is no provision for such	
was made for post facto approval. The same was also rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	approval under the West Bengal Health Scheme, 2008 and	
rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	no OPD treatment cost is admissible. A second application	
relevant portion of which is as under: "With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	was made for post facto approval. The same was also	
"With reference to his memo No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	rejected by a written intimation on 24 th October, 2017, the	
No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	relevant portion of which is as under:	
prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh, Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	"With reference to his memo	
Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	No.1018 dated 15.05.17 relating to a	
Block seeking post facto permission for treating his son at LVPEI,	prayer of Shri Madan Mohan Ghosh,	
for treating his son at LVPEI,	Jt. B.D.O., Goghat-I Development	
	Block seeking post facto permission	
Hyderabad on 13.08.15, the	for treating his son at LVPEI,	
	Hyderabad on 13.08.15, the	
undersigned is directed to say that the	undersigned is directed to say that the	
entire matter was taken up with the	entire matter was taken up with the	

ORDER SHEET

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary
	F.D. Medical Cell for the second time	3
	but the Technical member of WBHSA	
	has regretted the prayer of	
	reconsideration to accord post facto	
	permission for treatment of his son	
	outside the state for violation of	
	Clause-14 of F.D. Notification	
	No.7287-F dated 19/09/2008 and as	
	there is no provision of post facto	
	permission under the purview of extant	
	Rules & Regulation of W.B.H.S.' 08	
	till date."	
	Since we find there is no rule or notification for	
	post facto approval of treatment outside the State and as	
	we find the notification No.7287-F dated 19 th September,	
	2008 is not under challenge, no order can be passed on	
	this application. Therefore, the application, being O.A.	
	793 of 2019, is disposed of.	
SCN.	(P. Ramesh Kumar) (Soumitra Pal) MEMBER (A) CHAIRMAN	